



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 31

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Wednesday, April 19, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Speaker's Statement

Honourable Members I would like to reiterate to each of you and to all Albertans what I said in the House on March 14, 2000. Audio proceedings of this particular Assembly are available on the Internet. Citizens may listen on the Legislative Assembly of Alberta web site at www.assembly.ab.ca. If you look at that page you will see a reference to "Live Audio" and when you click on it you will be able to hear the activities of this Assembly from any appropriately equipped computer in the world. Coverage normally begins at 1:30 p.m. on a daily basis and continues to the conclusion of each sitting day. In other words this is gavel to gavel coverage.

Presenting Petitions

Mr. McFarland, Hon. Member for Little Bow, presented a petition from 2,717 Albertans urging the Government to prevent a variety of health authorities from shutting down 24 hour emergency services at certain hospitals.

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 382 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 304 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, presented a petition from 280 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, presented a petition from 109 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, presented a petition from 168 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 267 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 224 Hinton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 2,187 Albertans requesting the introduction of a Bill requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 313 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, presented a petition from 218 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 263 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 224 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, presented a petition from 319 Ft. McMurray residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 188 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, presented a petition from 266 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to reinstate the front license plate on all vehicles registered in Alberta.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Alberta Government to take an enlightened preventative approach and add the newer and more effective medications and therapies to the Alberta drug list to ensure the health of an aging society.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to introduce legislation requiring a minimum of two people on shifts from dark to daylight.

On request by Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

Notices of Motions

Point of Privilege

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, gave notice he would be raising a question of privilege before Orders of the Day on the issue of being denied entry into the Legislature Building on April 18, 2000, and thus prevented from being present in the Chamber while Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, was under consideration.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General:

Responses to questions raised on March 20, 2000, Department of Justice and Attorney General, 2000-2001 Committee of Supply consideration
Sessional Paper 678/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

“The President’s Letter” dated April 18, 2000, from David W. Bond, MD, President, Alberta Medical Association, to a Member of the Legislative Assembly (MLA), outlining its Board of Directors’ review of the Government’s proposed amendments to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and its concerns about the Bill

Sessional Paper 679/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

5 letters and 1 e-mail message from Alise Palk, Edson, Wayne Sklarski, Calgary, Tim Belec, Westeros, Brad Braun, Calgary, Matthew Berezan, Edmonton, and Dan Hula, Grande Cache, to Members of the Legislative Assembly, all expressing their opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 680/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

3 letters dated February 22 and March 5, 2000, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 681/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Letter dated February 26, 2000, from Dr. Peter R. Winters, Professor Emeritus, Faculty of Business, University of Alberta, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 682/2000

Letter dated February 22, 2000, from Norma Stimpson, Canmore, to Annette Trimbee, Director of Environmental Assessment and Strategy Division, Alberta Environment, expressing concerns regarding the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 683/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

3 letters dated February 16, 2000, from Michael Brett, Edmonton, February 21, 2000, from Alison Kranias and Keith Etsell, Calgary, and March 2, 2000, from Sue Arlidge, Exshaw, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concern regarding the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 684/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Letter dated January 2, 2000, from Mary Trumpener, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, urging the Government to protect the 11 wilderness areas chosen for preservation by Alberta Wilderness for the Foothills on the basis of Government scientific assessments

Sessional Paper 685/2000

Letter dated March 28, 2000, signed by 26 residents of Strathcona County, to Mr. Lougheed, Hon. Member for Clover Bar-Fort Saskatchewan, Vern Hartwell, Mayor of Strathcona County, Ken Epp, Member of Parliament, Elk Island, and M. Bruni, expressing strong objection to any seismic, oil, and gas activity in the County of Strathcona

Sessional Paper 686/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

2 letters dated February 22, 2000, from Sharyn Honeywell, Calgary, and undated, from Theresa Wood, Spruce Grove, to Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 687/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

2 letters dated February 8, 2000, from David Owen and Kimberly Dudinsky, both of Canmore, and a letter dated March 18, 2000, from Sonya Biamonte, Edmonton, to Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 688/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

2 e-mail messages, both undated and unaddressed, from Scott G. Sugden and Lynn Koss, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, and a letter, undated, from Marjorie Staples, Edmonton, to all Government Members of the Legislative Assembly, with an attached Edmonton Journal article dated February 15, 2000, expressing concerns and opposition to, and requesting the withdrawal of, Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 689/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Letter dated February 27, 2000, from Paul McKendrick, Halifax, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and letter dated March 4, 2000, from Diana Sheprak, Calgary to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and Annette Trimbee, Director of Environmental Assessment and Strategy Division, Alberta Environment, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Corporation development in the Spray Valley of Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 690/2000

Letter dated April 14, 2000, and associated attachment, from Nick J. Chamchuk, Edmonton, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, congratulating the Government on allowing soft lenses as standard medical supplies for cataract surgery, expressing concern about the proposed amendments to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, and advising that he has filed a complaint with Advertising Standards Canada regarding the full-page advertisement in the April 14, 2000 edition of the Edmonton Journal regarding Bill 11, citing the information to be false and misleading

Sessional Paper 691/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Letter dated April 19, 2000, from Mr. Dickson, Official Opposition House Leader, to Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly, listing communication and access issues regarding the activities at the Legislative Assembly the evening of April 18, 2000, and urging the Speaker to take appropriate action to ensure remedial action prior to the evening Session on April 19, 2000

Sessional Paper 692/2000

Invoice showing the expenditure of \$50 by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, on a one-quarter page advertisement in an unnamed January/February newsletter

Sessional Paper 693/2000

Partially completed checklist intended for Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to update Government costs incurred promoting Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 694/2000

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment:

Responses to questions raised on March 13, 2000, Department of Environment, 2000-2001 Committee of Supply Subcommittee D consideration

Sessional Paper 695/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Letter, undated, from Eugene E. Mondor, R.N., B..Sc.N., to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the plans for privatization and creation of for-profit hospitals and to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 696/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Public Inquiry Report to the Attorney General, dated March 27, 2000, regarding the death of Jordan Daniel Quinney

Sessional Paper 697/2000

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Chart dated April 2000, entitled "Conflicting Interests at the Calgary Regional Health Authority", taken from "Clear Answers, The Economics and Politics of For-Profit Medicine" prepared by Kevin Taft and Gillian Steward

Sessional Paper 698/2000

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, tabled the following:

Excerpts of a letter documenting events that occurred during the Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act rally in Calgary, April 15, 2000

Sessional Paper 699/2000

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Letter dated April 17, 2000, from Leo F. Klug, Ph.D, Chair, Catholic Health Association of Alberta and Affiliates (CHAAA), to Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, attaching a statement entitled "The Common Good - How Is It Best Served?" setting out concerns and questions regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 700/2000

Temporary Recess

The Speaker recessed the Assembly for the 30 minutes remaining in Oral Question Period.

Recognitions

Mr. Strang, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead: Edson Sabres midget hockey team on winning the Alberta provincial midget A championship held in Slave Lake March 24-26, 2000, coach Harold Switzer and the assistant coaches, sponsors, parents, and fans for their support

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark: Honouring Passover which begins the night of April 19, 2000, and reading an excerpt from the Saturday Prayer book explaining the story of Exodus

Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose: 105 students from Wetaskiwin Composite High School music groups, leaving April 19, 2000, to represent Canada in the Harrogate International Youth Music Festival in England

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford: McHappy Days, May 16, 2000, the proceeds of which are donated to two different charitable organizations, one of which is the Aaron Moser Foundation for Spinal Research

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona: Brian Staszewski, on being recognized by Time Magazine as a hero for the planet, for his founding of the destination conservation program in 1987 which helps schools save energy, conserve water, and minimize waste production

Point of Privilege

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, raised a question of privilege under Standing Order 15 regarding being denied entry into the Legislature Building on April 18, 2000, and thus prevented from being present in the Chamber while Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, was under consideration.

The Speaker heard from Hon. Mr. Hancock, Mrs. Fritz, Mrs. Burgener, Mr. Herard, Mr. Severtson, Mr. Dickson, Ms Kryczka, Mr. Magnus, Ms Olsen, and Mr. Pham.

The Speaker stated that he would rule on this issue in the near future.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Questions were accepted:

WQ14. Moved by Ms Leibovici:

What are the actual numbers of, and occupancy rates for, acute care beds serving the Calgary Regional Health Authority from April 1, 1992 to March 20, 2000?

WQ16. Moved by Ms Blakeman:

How many agreements is the Department of Justice and Attorney General currently negotiating with other jurisdictions pursuant to the Reciprocal Enforcement of Maintenance Orders Act?

The following Written Question was accepted as amended:

WQ15. Moved by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, on behalf of Ms Carlson:

How many bears were shot between April 1, 1998 to March 31, 1999 and April 1, 1999 to March 31, 2000 by private landowners and grazing leaseholders on Crown land, or by anyone acting on their behalf, and in how many cases did landowners or leaseholders call Alberta Environment to trap nuisance bears?

Hon. Mr. Mar, Minister of Environment, moved the motion be amended to read:

According to Alberta Environment records, how many bears were killed between April 1, 1998 to March 31, 1999 and April 1, 1999 to March 31, 2000 by private landowners and grazing leaseholders on Crown land, or by anyone acting on their behalf, and in how many cases did landowners or leaseholders call Alberta Environment to deal with nuisance bears?

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

WQ17, WQ18, WQ19, WQ20, WQ21.

Motions for Returns

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

MR29, MR31, MR32, MR33, MR34, MR35, MR36, MR37, MR38, MR39, MR40, MR41, MR42, MR43, MR44, MR45, MR46, MR47, MR48, MR49.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, it was agreed at 4:59 p.m. that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. it would be in Committee of the Whole and the Speaker left the Chair.

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 19, 2000— 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Committee of the Whole

(Assembly in Committee)

The following Bill was taken under consideration:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

After some time spent therein, Mr. Fritz moved that the Committee rise and report progress. The question being put, with Mr. Tannas in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 27

Amery	Evans	Lougheed
Boutilier	Fritz	Marz
Calahasen	Hancock	McFarland
Cao	Herard	Nelson
Cardinal	Jacques	Renner
Clegg	Johnson	Severtson
Coutts	Jonson	Shariff
Doerksen	Klapstein	Tarchuk
Dunford	Langevin	Taylor

Against the motion: 10

Blakeman	MacBeth	Sloan
Carlson	Olsen	Soetaert
Dickson	Sapers	Smith
Leibovici		

The Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Mr. Shariff, Hon. Member for Calgary-McCall, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Subamendment to the amendment to Bill 11 introduced by the Minister of Health on and Wellness on April 12, 2000 (Section A) (Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark) — Debate adjourned
Sessional Paper 701/2000

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 12:08 a.m. Thursday, April 20, 2000, until 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, April 19, 2000